

**From:** Carfora, Debra (ENRD)  
**Location:** Call In: **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**  
**Importance:** Normal  
**Subject:** Fw: Utah Regional Haze Litigation  
**Start Date/Time:** Wed 8/9/2017 2:00:00 PM  
**End Date/Time:** Wed 8/9/2017 2:30:00 PM

Here are the details for the call, as I mentioned to Mike and Brian earlier, sounds like in addition to UT RH, PacifiCorp may also have something to say about the title V petition. I understand EPA will all be in listening mode if that's the case.

Sent from my iPhone

---

**From:** Carfora, Debra (ENRD) <Debra.Carfora@usdoj.gov>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 8, 2017 3:49:55 PM  
**To:** Greenglass, Nora; Laumann, Sara; Odendahl, Steve; Talbert, Stephanie (ENRD); Blaine Rawson; 'Allen, Melanie'; 'Jeff Richards (Jeff.Richards@PacifiCorp.com)'; 'megan.mckay@PacifiCorp.com'; 'Michael.Jenkins@PacifiCorp.com'  
**Subject:** Utah Regional Haze Litigation  
**When:** Wednesday, August 9, 2017 8:00 AM-8:30 AM.  
**Where:** Call In: **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**

Call In: **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy**  
Code:

**To:** Krallman, John[krallman.john@epa.gov]; Lee, Michael[lee.michaelg@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Logan, Paul[Logan.Paul@epa.gov]; Cherry, Randall[Cherry.Randall@epa.gov]; Greenglass, Nora[Greenglass.Nora@epa.gov]; Zenick, Elliott[Zenick.Elliott@epa.gov]; Odendahl, Steve[Odendahl.Steve@epa.gov]  
**From:** Laumann, Sara  
**Sent:** Wed 6/21/2017 1:44:00 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Checking-in on the status of the response to the Hunter Title V Petition

Internal and Deliberative

Thanks John for the update. [and looping in those working on an action that covers the same facility]

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

-Sara

**From:** Krallman, John  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 21, 2017 7:25 AM  
**To:** Laumann, Sara <Laumann.Sara@epa.gov>; Lee, Michael <lee.michaelg@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Logan, Paul <Logan.Paul@epa.gov>; Cherry, Randall <Cherry.Randall@epa.gov>

**Subject:** RE: Checking-in on the status of the response to the Hunter Title V Petition

Sara,

Since the court has entered the CD, we're definitely planning on meeting that August 31 deadline.

## Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

If you have any other questions, feel free to let me know.

John

**From:** Laumann, Sara

**Sent:** Tuesday, June 20, 2017 5:36 PM

**To:** Krallman, John <[krallman.john@epa.gov](mailto:krallman.john@epa.gov)>; Lee, Michael <[lee.michaelg@epa.gov](mailto:lee.michaelg@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Logan, Paul <[Logan.Paul@epa.gov](mailto:Logan.Paul@epa.gov)>; Cherry, Randall <[Cherry.Randall@epa.gov](mailto:Cherry.Randall@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** Checking-in on the status of the response to the Hunter Title V Petition

Hi John and Mike

With the August CD deadline a couple months away, I wanted to touch base on the status of the analysis/options to respond to the Petition.

I recognize the HQ offices have the lead on this, so just wondering how it's going, and when there might be information to share with our office.

We're of course happy to support and help out in responding to the petition, which I did earlier

this year in providing background info to John.

Last I heard the Agency still planned to meet the August deadline and the HQ offices were working on an analysis.

We met with our management today to go over our court deadlines, which inspired this check-in email.

Thanks in advance for an update!

-Sara

Sara L. Laumann ● Associate Regional Counsel ● US EPA Region 8 ● (303) 312-6443

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Mon 8/28/2017 6:43:57 PM  
**Subject:** RE: we have some prep work on Hunter for Patrick

Are you free now? I am about to leave for a Dr. appt. I can pop down before I go.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Monday, August 28, 2017 2:42 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** we have some prep work on Hunter for Patrick

Let's talk today if you are available.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Wed 8/2/2017 11:51:14 PM  
**Subject:** RE: PacifiCorp T5

Got it. I could be a little more specific on cases. But I may need some help since I didn't participate a lot. For future cases, will a violation of Title V help us in situations where we reached SOL on PSD? I am not sure.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 02, 2017 7:48 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: PacifiCorp T5

Looks like we have more time. See his specific request below.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Traylor, Patrick  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 02, 2017 7:46 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>; Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: PacifiCorp T5

Just received word that the OGC-OECA meeting has been postponed until next week, so take the time you need with the draft.

It will be helpful to me to have copies of principal authorities cited and a focus on how OAR's current plan would have: (1) impacted past cases; and (2) will impact ongoing cases.

**Patrick Traylor**

Deputy Assistant Administrator

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5238 (office)

(202) 809-8796 (cell)

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 2, 2017 7:40 PM  
**To:** Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>; Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: PacifiCorp T5

Terri submitted a memo to me for review about 10 minutes ago. I will review quickly and flip it to you. Under normal circumstances, I would want more time to review it and make any appropriate edits. Given the time constraints, I will send you the draft this evening.

Apple

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Traylor, Patrick

**Sent:** Wednesday, August 02, 2017 7:24 PM

**To:** Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** PacifiCorp T5

I understand there's been a meeting scheduled with OAR and OGC Thursday to discuss this. I'll need the material we discussed earlier this week if I'm to carry the ball on OECA's point of view. I've asked for a delay so I can participate fully in the discussion; I might not get the delay.

**Patrick Traylor**

Deputy Assistant Administrator

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5238 (office)

(202) 809-8796 (cell)



**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thur 7/27/2017 4:37:15 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter- Revised

I am calling in.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 12:36 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter- Revised

No, I think we are good. Are you coming in or calling in?

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 12:34 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter- Revised

OK- do you still want to talk before the call?

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 12:26 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter- Revised

Thanks!

I sent it up to Susan. Depending on what happens this afternoon with Sarah we may not have to brief this up on Monday but I got a call from Mike Lee and apparently Justin is fully behind this effort so we are going to have to elevate this one way or another.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 12:03 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter- Revised

Just figured out it won't attach if I have the document open on my system

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 10:05 AM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** Hunter

***Ms. Apple Chapman*** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tue 8/1/2017 8:25:44 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter briefing for Patrick

yep. I am Flexi today but my number rings thru.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 1, 2017 4:24 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** Hunter briefing for Patrick

I got a little bit of guidance from Susan today. Are you available to chat in a few minutes?

***Ms. Apple Chapman*** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]; Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Dean, Abigail[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dean, Abigail  
**Sent:** Mon 7/3/2017 8:52:50 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

That sounds great. I'll be back in the office Wednesday morning. Thanks, Terri.

Abigail Dean, Attorney  
Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Monday, July 03, 2017 2:52 PM  
**To:** Dean, Abigail <Dean.Abigail@epa.gov>; Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

Welcome aboard. I just printed off the materials to read on the way home. Happy to chat with you later this week or next if you want to just get grounded.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Dean, Abigail

**Sent:** Monday, July 03, 2017 4:50 PM

**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>; Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Dean, Abigail <[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov](mailto:Dean.Abigail@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** Hunter Title V Petition

Hi Apple and Terri. Jim Eppers asked me to represent the Region 8 Legal Enforcement Program in future meetings regarding the PacifiCorps Hunter Title V Petition. Peter Keller added me to the Hunter Sharepoint Site and I have started to review the relevant materials. I spoke with Sara Laumann last week and she suggested that I reach out to you to find out how I may be able to assist in this matter. If I can contribute to your efforts in any way, please let me know.

Thank you,

Abby Dean

Abigail Dean, Attorney  
Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Brooks, Phillip[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov]; Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]; Fried, Gregory[Fried.Gregory@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kelley, Rosemarie  
**Sent:** Wed 9/6/2017 2:25:36 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter briefing paper revised

Just scanned it quickly and it seems to address my concerns.

Rosemarie

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Wednesday, September 06, 2017 10:04 AM  
**To:** Kelley, Rosemarie <Kelley.Rosemarie@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Brooks, Phillip <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>; Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>; Fried, Gregory <Fried.Gregory@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Hunter briefing paper revised  
**Importance:** High

Rosemarie

Please let me know if this revised paper addresses your comments. Thanks.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Vetter, Cheryl[Vetter.Cheryl@epa.gov]  
**From:** McDonald, Janet  
**Sent:** Wed 1/25/2017 10:30:06 PM  
**Subject:** Upcoming Petitions

Hi, Apple-

We have 4 petitions with deadline lawsuits in the first half of 2017 and two a little further down the road. **Please let us know if OECA will be involved in any of these.** Let me know if there are any questions. Thanks!

### **Duke Asheville/Roxboro EGUs**

- You may have missed my earlier emails on these.
- 2 almost verbatim petitions with one issue: 2 NC SIP rules require that the Asheville/Roxboro title V permits include emission limits to assure compliance with the 1-hour SO2 NAAQS now.
- There is a Motion for Summary Judgment from the Petitioners before the DC Court to compel us to respond immediately. We have submitted a reply and declarations stating that it is reasonable for EPA to respond by June 30, 2017.
- We have been working to get the Issues Paper ready for team review in case we get a bad break and have to respond earlier than June.

### **Scrubgrass EGU (PA)**

- Single issue is whether 112(i)(B)(3) provides for an additional extension of MATS



rule compliance date for mining waste operations

- Agreement in principle on signature deadline: May 12, 2017

### **NRG Morgantown EGU ( MD)**

- Issues are compliance assurance monitoring for opacity and PM, in particular for opacity during startup.

- Agreement in principle on signature deadline: May 26, 2017

### **Alon Refinery (SJVAPCD)**

- We will be responding to Claims 2 and 3 of the petition.
- Claim 2: The District did not choose a proper baseline year for the purposes of calculating the amount of required emission offsets.
- Claim 3: The District used fault emission assumptions related to crude oil VOC emissions, which lead to an underestimate of the required emissions offsets.
- Agreement in principle on signature deadline: July 31, 2017

### **PacifiCorp Hunter**

- Issues are generally that PSD should have applied to modifications occurring in the 90's and the SO2/NOx PALs are unlawful.
- Agreement in principle on signature deadline: August 31, 2017

Janet McDonald, Team Lead

Operating Permits Group

Air Quality Policy Division

Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards

U.S. EPA

109 T.W. Alexander Dr., RTP NC 27709

Mail Code C504-05

919 541-1450

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** USEPA  
**Sent:** Wed 6/1/2016 9:15:26 PM  
**Subject:** EPA acts to reduce regional haze in Utah and improve visibility in National Parks

*Federal plan for Hunter and Huntington power plants to reduce harmful nitrogen oxide emissions by an estimated 9,885 tons each year*

**Contact:**

Richard Mylott, 303-312-6654, [mylott.richard@epa.gov](mailto:mylott.richard@epa.gov)

Laura Jenkins, 303-312-6256, [jenkins.laura@epa.gov](mailto:jenkins.laura@epa.gov)

(Denver, Colo.—June 1, 2016) The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has made a final determination to partially approve and partially disapprove the state of Utah's regional haze plan to reduce haze-forming emissions affecting Arches, Canyonlands and seven other National Parks and Wilderness Areas protected as "Class I" areas under the Clean Air Act. EPA is issuing a federal plan that will require the installation of emission control technologies and reduce nitrogen oxide emissions from four electrical generating units at PacifiCorp's Hunter and Huntington power plants in Emery County, Utah by 9,885 tons each year. The Agency is also approving portions of the state's plan addressing particulate matter emissions at these plants.

"EPA is taking action to cut harmful haze pollution at some of our nation's most treasured and popular National Parks," said Shaun McGrath, EPA Region 8 Administrator. "The steps included in this plan will rely on proven, widely used pollution control strategies used at power plants across the country, protect public health, and improve visibility for those who visit our Western parks for years to come."

The federal plan will reduce harmful nitrogen oxide emissions and improve visibility conditions in nine Class I areas, including some of the nation's most highly visited national parks. Visibility conditions at Canyonlands National Park, the area most impacted by emissions from the Hunter and Huntington plants, are estimated to improve by more than 3 deciviews. One deciview equals an incremental change in visibility perceivable by the human eye. Haze-forming pollution, including nitrogen oxides, sulfur dioxide and particles, poses health risks and contributes to respiratory conditions, such as asthma, emphysema and bronchitis, heart disease, and premature death.

EPA's assessment of the state's regional haze plan included the review of visibility benefits, information on costs, other measures and the extensive feedback the agency received through public comments and a January 2016 public hearing. Following this review and the requirements outlined in the Clean Air Act, the federal plan will include the use of selective catalytic reduction (SCR) systems, a proven, cost-effective control technology, at the Hunter and Huntington power plants. The federal plan requires compliance, including the installation of emission controls, within five years.

The Clean Air Act establishes the prevention of any future, and the remedying of any existing, impairment of visibility in 156 mandatory Class I national parks and wilderness areas. To address this goal, Congress required EPA to adopt rules and required states to develop regional haze plans to reduce haze-forming emissions and meet the requirements of the Act.

For more information, including EPA's final rule, visit: <http://www2.epa.gov/region8/air-program>.

For more on visibility, regional haze and the Clean Air Act visit: <https://www.epa.gov/visibility>

If you would rather not receive future communications from Environmental Protection Agency, let us know by clicking [here](#).  
Environmental Protection Agency, 1595 Wynkoop St., Denver, CO 80202-1129 United States

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Wed 2/7/2018 7:16:24 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Petition for Review

We should have kept Keri- she is a formidable opponent.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 07, 2018 2:10 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>; Fried, Gregory <Fried.Gregory@epa.gov>;  
Brooks, Phillip <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** FW: Hunter Petition for Review

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Traylor, Patrick  
**Sent:** Wednesday, February 07, 2018 1:50 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Hunter Petition for Review

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Fried, Gregory  
**Sent:** Tue 1/31/2017 12:58:15 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Would you like to be invited...Title V Petition / issues similar to Deseret

OK by me

Gregory Fried  
Chief, Stationary Source Enforcement Branch  
U.S. EPA  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
(202)564-7016  
[fried.gregory@epa.gov](mailto:fried.gregory@epa.gov)

On Jan 30, 2017, at 4:43 PM, Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)> wrote:

Terri,

You can be assigned to this one. I have a call with Janet tomorrow to discuss all of the pending Title V petitions and let her know which ones OECA needs to participate in – I will let her know you are covering this for OECA. I was going to work on assignments after talking to Janet but I am happy to have you raise your hand. Thanks!

Apple

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Monday, January 30, 2017 1:17 PM  
**To:** Rochlin, David <[Rochlin.David@epa.gov](mailto:Rochlin.David@epa.gov)>; Laumann, Sara <[Laumann.Sara@epa.gov](mailto:Laumann.Sara@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Eppers, Jim <[Eppers.Jim@epa.gov](mailto:Eppers.Jim@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>; Fried, Gregory <[Fried.Gregory@epa.gov](mailto:Fried.Gregory@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Would you like to be invited...Title V Petition / issues similar to Deseret

Happy to do so as long as OK with Apple and Greg. I have recently been a bit energized on

the NSR front with the two latest decisions.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Rochlin, David

**Sent:** Friday, January 27, 2017 11:05 AM

**To:** Laumann, Sara <[Laumann.Sara@epa.gov](mailto:Laumann.Sara@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Eppers, Jim <[Eppers.Jim@epa.gov](mailto:Eppers.Jim@epa.gov)>; Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Would you like to be invited...Title V Petition / issues similar to Deseret

I am not taking on any new assignments at this point, but I am copying Jim Eppers on this message with the intent that he will determine whether someone from LEP should be involved in this. In the meantime, thank you, Sara, as always, for keeping your enforcement colleagues in the loop on matters that might be of interest to us!

**From:** Laumann, Sara

**Sent:** Friday, January 27, 2017 8:55 AM

**To:** Rochlin, David <[Rochlin.David@epa.gov](mailto:Rochlin.David@epa.gov)>; Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** Would you like to be invited...Title V Petition / issues similar to Deseret

Hi All

Checking to see if one of you, or others from OECA, would like to be in the loop on permit issues in Utah. We have a Title V petition from Sierra Club that raises PSD permitting issues similar to those we faced in Deseret, which is not surprising as this permit was also issued by Utah. I haven't worked on a Title V response for some time, and need to familiarize myself with the new-and-improved procedures...but just in case your offices aren't in the loop yet, wanted to reach out since we all worked on the Deseret issues.

Anyway, the Region is setting up a meeting/conference call for next week to get Mike Owens' thoughts/options on issues raised in the Hunter Power Plant Title V petition before Mike retires on Feb 3. While the likely deadline for the Administrator's response won't be until the end of August 2017, we want to capture Mike's thinking before he leaves the agency. I haven't focused on this much yet due to other priorities, but plan to do so in the next few days.

Lemme know if you or someone else wants to be looped in.

Thanks,

-Sara

**Sara L. Laumann**

Associate Regional Counsel

303-312-6443



**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Argentieri, Sabrina  
**Sent:** Fri 9/8/2017 6:22:22 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter follow up

No, not yet. He said he would be back by 1:30. I'll check in with him.

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Friday, September 8, 2017 2:21:54 PM  
**To:** Argentieri, Sabrina  
**Subject:** FW: Hunter follow up

Anything from Jason yet?

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Traylor, Patrick  
**Sent:** Friday, September 08, 2017 2:21 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Kelley, Rosemarie <Kelley.Rosemarie@epa.gov>; Brooks, Phillip <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter follow up

Thanks, Apple. This issue is moving quickly; I need to know ASAP whether any defendants have briefed the issue of whether the Title V permit shield affects our PSD claims. Please also forward the email from DOJ on this point that you mentioned yesterday.

**Patrick Traylor**

Deputy Assistant Administrator

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5238 (office)

(202) 809-8796 (cell)

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 7, 2017 4:51 PM  
**To:** Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Kelley, Rosemarie <[Kelley.Rosemarie@epa.gov](mailto:Kelley.Rosemarie@epa.gov)>; Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Hunter follow up

Patrick,

Thank you for taking the time today to further discuss the important enforcement issues raised by the Hunter title V petition response. You asked for briefs where defendant's raised a permit shield argument. Because every case we have litigated involved a situation where no permit was issued at all (major or minor), the permit shield defense has been argued slightly differently than the scenarios we discussed today. For example, in the attached brief, CEMEX attempted to rely on the permit shield as a defense to our title V claims (i.e., CEMEX was operating in violation of title V because its title V permit failed to include all applicable PSD requirements), not the underlying title I PSD claim. I have a request out for other briefs where the permit shield was raised as a defense.

Thank you.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thur 7/27/2017 10:19:30 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter briefing paper

It's at 2:15 in the AA conference room. Yes, you should attend.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 5:54 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter briefing paper

Thanks for doing that. What time is the meeting on Monday. And do you want me to attend. I am fine not attending.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 5:29 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Cc:** Krallman, John  
**Subject:** Hunter briefing paper

Teri

Susan asked me to add the other two options to our briefing paper. This is what she is sending up to Patrick for the meeting on Monday. I'm copying John so OGC has a copy of our paper.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Mon 8/28/2017 6:42:30 PM  
**Subject:** we have some prep work on Hunter for Patrick

Let's talk today if you are available.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Krallman, John[krallman.john@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Mon 8/28/2017 6:42:04 PM  
**Subject:** We need your Hunter final options paper for Patrick

He asked for it today.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Fri 9/1/2017 7:00:32 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

No. I am available and still working. I am WAH.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Friday, September 01, 2017 3:00 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

Will do. Are you outta here now?

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Friday, September 01, 2017 2:58 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

Here are my comments/questions. You can include the case cites into this version. Let me know if you want to discuss any of my comments. Have a great weekend!

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa

**Sent:** Friday, September 01, 2017 12:54 PM

**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

Putting in cases now. I will send you an updated version in about 15 minutes.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.

**From:** Chapman, Apple

**Sent:** Friday, September 01, 2017 12:48 PM

**To:** Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>



**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

Thanks! I will let you know if I have comments.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 31, 2017 2:27 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter Title V

Apple- here is what I have. I need to insert case names. I thought I brought that folder home with me, but I didn't. I insert tomorrow am.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 31, 2017 7:21 AM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter Title V

If you can get me something by COB today that would be helpful. We need to get Patrick materials 2 days in advance and Monday is a Holiday. Thanks.

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 29, 2017, at 3:51 PM, Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)> wrote:

Got it! Thanks. I am going to try to finish this tonight if possible.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 3:39 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

You have more time (in case you did not see the other emails). Meeting is next week and the pre-meeting will be early next week.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:41 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter Title V

working on that now. Still want me to include Options B and C?

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division

Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:34 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

I'm trying to get us on his calendar tomorrow morning. I think just a crisp one – two pager on the permit shield on top of the OGC paper. If he still doesn't understand our concerns I am not sure what more we can do. Thanks!

***Ms. Apple Chapman*** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:00 AM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter Title V

Got it.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:17 AM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** FW: Hunter Title V

Patrick was trying to get this meeting rescheduled but it looks like OGC and the program office want to go ahead so we will be having a separate meeting with Mandy. I would like to get Patrick the materials soon. Thanks.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Gunasekara, Mandy  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:07 AM  
**To:** Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Wood, Anna <[Wood.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Wood.Anna@epa.gov)>; Dunham, Sarah <[Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov](mailto:Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov)>; Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>; Schwab, Justin <[schwab.justin@epa.gov](mailto:schwab.justin@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

Patrick,

I briefly touched base with OGC and they are ready to go for tomorrow, so I propose we keep the briefing tomorrow and hear directly from the program/OGC perspective. I will make myself available for a follow-up briefing with OECA next week when your team is ready to go.

Best,

Mandy

**From:** Traylor, Patrick  
**Sent:** Monday, August 28, 2017 2:44 PM  
**To:** Gunasekara, Mandy <[Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov](mailto:Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Wood, Anna <[Wood.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Wood.Anna@epa.gov)>; Dunham, Sarah <[Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov](mailto:Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov)>; Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** Hunter Title V

Mandy:

OECA is still thinking through the effect of OAR's proposal on the permit shield defense. So that we can complete our analysis, I'd like to ask that we reschedule this Wednesday's Hunter meeting to sometime late next week.

Thanks in advance,

Patrick

**Patrick Traylor**

Deputy Assistant Administrator

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5238 (office)

(202) 809-8796 (cell)

**To:** Shinkman, Susan[Shinkman.Susan@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thur 7/27/2017 8:27:12 PM  
**Subject:** Hunter title V issue

Can I stop by at 5? I have been in meetings with OAQPS and OGC for the last 2 ½ hours. I think we are going to have to brief Patrick. OGC recommends we bring our political management into these discussions. Even if Hunter is decided under one of the other options, there are 2 more right behind this one that raise similar issues.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]; Fried, Gregory[Fried.Gregory@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Wed 8/2/2017 8:27:43 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Enforcement Cases Where Source Got a Minor Source Permit, but We Allege Major??

DTE did not have any type of permit when we filed the lawsuit. They got a PSD permit 3 or 4 years later. I think we should survey the regions (maybe a quick email to the enforcement call)?

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Wednesday, August 02, 2017 4:24 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>; Fried, Gregory <Fried.Gregory@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Enforcement Cases Where Source Got a Minor Source Permit, but We Allege Major??

I can only think of DTE. Any others?? I need to look to finalize my memo for Patrick on the Hunter Petition

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.





**To:** Werner, Jacqueline[Werner.Jacqueline@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tue 7/25/2017 3:08:27 PM  
**Subject:** RE: AED General Agenda July 24 2017.docx

We do need to talk to Susan about Hunter so leave it on. Thanks.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Werner, Jacqueline  
**Sent:** Monday, July 24, 2017 6:25 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>; Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>; Schefski, Melissa <Schefski.Melissa@epa.gov>; Kaul, Meetu <Kaul.Meetu@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Fried, Gregory <Fried.Gregory@epa.gov>; Belser, Evan <Belser.Evan@epa.gov>; Brooks, Phillip <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** AED General Agenda July 24 2017.docx

Attached please find the draft Agenda for tomorrow's AED General. Please let me know if you have any addition/changes.

**To:** Benitez-Clark, Rowena[Benitez-Clark.Rowena@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tue 8/29/2017 6:54:06 PM  
**Subject:** Meeting with Patrick

Rowena,

There was a meeting on Patrick's calendar scheduled for tomorrow at 2 or 3 PM titled "Hunter Title V Petition". It was also on my calendar but it looks like it was rescheduled to next Thursday. Mandy sent Patrick an email saying the meeting tomorrow is going forward despite the reschedule notice. If the meeting is happening tomorrow, Patrick needs to attend and he has requested that we meet with him in advance. Is there any way to find out the status of the Hunter Title V Petition meeting? If it is happening tomorrow, we need at least 30 minutes with Patrick in advance. If it has been changed to next week (and it looks like it has), we need to schedule something with Patrick later this week or next week in advance of the meeting. Hope that all makes sense. Please invite Rosemarie Kelley, Gregory Fried, me, Phillip Brooks and Teresa Dykes.

Let me know if you have questions.

Thanks.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tue 8/29/2017 6:42:13 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

Yes, he asked for an analysis of all options.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:41 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter Title V

working on that now. Still want me to include Options B and C?

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 2:34 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

I'm trying to get us on his calendar tomorrow morning. I think just a crisp one – two pager on the permit shield on top of the OGC paper. If he still doesn't understand our concerns I am not sure what more we can do. Thanks!

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 10:00 AM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter Title V

Got it.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:17 AM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Subject:** FW: Hunter Title V

Patrick was trying to get this meeting rescheduled but it looks like OGC and the program office want to go ahead so we will be having a separate meeting with Mandy. I would like to get Patrick the materials soon. Thanks.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Gunasekara, Mandy  
**Sent:** Tuesday, August 29, 2017 9:07 AM  
**To:** Traylor, Patrick <[traylor.patrick@epa.gov](mailto:traylor.patrick@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Wood, Anna <[Wood.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Wood.Anna@epa.gov)>; Dunham, Sarah <[Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov](mailto:Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov)>;  
Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>;  
Schwab, Justin <[schwab.justin@epa.gov](mailto:schwab.justin@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V

Patrick,

I briefly touched base with OGC and they are ready to go for tomorrow, so I propose we keep the briefing tomorrow and hear directly from the program/OGC perspective. I will make myself available for a follow-up briefing with OECA next week when your team is ready to go.

Best,

Mandy

**From:** Traylor, Patrick  
**Sent:** Monday, August 28, 2017 2:44 PM  
**To:** Gunasekara, Mandy <[Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov](mailto:Gunasekara.Mandy@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Wood, Anna <[Wood.Anna@epa.gov](mailto:Wood.Anna@epa.gov)>; Dunham, Sarah <[Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov](mailto:Dunham.Sarah@epa.gov)>;  
Brooks, Phillip <[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov](mailto:Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Hunter Title V

Mandy:

OECA is still thinking through the effect of OAR's proposal on the permit shield defense. So that we can complete our analysis, I'd like to ask that we reschedule this Wednesday's Hunter meeting to sometime late next week.

Thanks in advance,

Patrick

**Patrick Traylor**

Deputy Assistant Administrator

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5238 (office)

(202) 809-8796 (cell)

**To:** Kelley, Rosemarie[Kelley.Rosemarie@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Brooks, Phillip[Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov]; Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Wed 9/6/2017 1:42:49 PM  
**Subject:** Hunter

I will have a redrafted version to you in the next 15 minutes. Thanks.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tue 9/5/2017 2:01:34 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Need anything else for Hunter Mtg with Patrick?

I am working on making some additional revisions. I will send the revised version for you to review later today. Thanks.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 05, 2017 9:55 AM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Need anything else for Hunter Mtg with Patrick?

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.



**From:** Dean, Abigail  
**Location:** Call-in or R8DEN-6108-Grizzly/R8-Wynkoop  
**Importance:** Normal  
**Subject:** PacifiCorp Hunter Petition - Enforcement  
**Start Date/Time:** Wed 7/19/2017 8:00:00 PM  
**End Date/Time:** Wed 7/19/2017 8:30:00 PM

Discussion with OECA on implications for enforcement.

Please use the following call-in information to join a teleconference:

US Toll Free: 1 866 299.9141

Participant Passcode: 28850179#

**To:** +12025283329[+12025283329]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Mon 8/7/2017 11:30:00 AM

```
<?xml version="1.0"?>
<CalendarNotificationContent xmlns:xsd="http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema"
xmlns:xsi="http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema-instance" Version="1.0">
  <CalNotifType>Summary</CalNotifType>
  <CalNotifTypeDesc>Agenda</CalNotifTypeDesc>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Monday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>8/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime />
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Tuesday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>8/8</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>0:00</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>In Office 8:30 - 6:00</Subject>
    <Location />
  </CalEvent>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Monday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>8/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime>11:00</TimeOfStartTime>
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Monday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>8/7</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>12:00</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>PacifiCorp-Hunter Title V Petition Response/Call-in #1-866-299-3188, Code:
2142764</Subject>
    <Location>4304 WJCN</Location>
  </CalEvent>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Monday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>8/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime>14:00</TimeOfStartTime>
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Monday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>8/7</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>15:00</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>Refinery Monthly</Subject>
    <Location>Greg's Office</Location>
  </CalEvent>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Tuesday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>8/8</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime />
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Wednesday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>8/9</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>0:00</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>Flexiplace 8:30-6:00</Subject>
    <Location>202-528-3329</Location>
  </CalEvent>
</CalendarNotificationContent>
```

**To:** +12025283329[+12025283329]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thur 9/7/2017 11:30:01 AM

```
<?xml version="1.0"?>
<CalendarNotificationContent xmlns:xsd="http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema"
xmlns:xsi="http://www.w3.org/2001/XMLSchema-instance" Version="1.0">
  <CalNotifType>Summary</CalNotifType>
  <CalNotifTypeDesc>Agenda</CalNotifTypeDesc>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>9/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime />
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Friday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>9/8</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>0:00</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>Flexiplace 8:30-6:00</Subject>
    <Location>202-528-3329</Location>
  </CalEvent>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>9/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime>10:00</TimeOfStartTime>
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>9/7</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>10:30</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>OECA ALL HANDS MEETING w/OCE/OAP/IO, call in number 1 (866) 299-3188, code (202)
564-8179</Subject>
    <Location>6226WJC-South</Location>
  </CalEvent>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>9/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime>11:00</TimeOfStartTime>
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>9/7</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>12:00</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>Pre-Brief on Hunter Title V Petition</Subject>
    <Location>WJCS RM# 3216</Location>
  </CalEvent>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>9/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime>12:00</TimeOfStartTime>
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>9/7</DateOfEndTime>
    <TimeOfEndTime>13:00</TimeOfEndTime>
    <Subject>Midwest Gen Plaintiffs' Meeting</Subject>
    <Location>866-410-9426, Conference code: 761 012 7617, Security Code: 6515</Location>
  </CalEvent>
  <CalEvent>
    <DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>
    <DateOfStartTime>9/7</DateOfStartTime>
    <TimeOfStartTime>15:30</TimeOfStartTime>
    <DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Thursday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>
    <DateOfEndTime>9/7</DateOfEndTime>
```

<TimeOfEndTime>16:00</TimeOfEndTime>  
<Subject>Sinclair biweekly call </Subject>  
<Location>tel: 866.410.9426 conf. code: 2025145258#</Location>  
</CalEvent>  
<CalEvent>  
<DayOfWeekOfStartTime>Friday</DayOfWeekOfStartTime>  
<DateOfStartTime>9/8</DateOfStartTime>  
<TimeOfStartTime />  
<DayOfWeekOfEndTime>Saturday</DayOfWeekOfEndTime>  
<DateOfEndTime>9/9</DateOfEndTime>  
<TimeOfEndTime>0:00</TimeOfEndTime>  
<Subject>Compressed Day</Subject>  
<Location />  
</CalEvent>  
</CalendarNotificationContent>

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tue 9/5/2017 5:01:28 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter

I think they are all fine.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 05, 2017 12:53 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Hunter

Can you take a look at these additional revisions and let me know what you think.  
Thanks.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tue 9/5/2017 1:55:25 PM  
**Subject:** Need anything else for Hunter Mtg with Patrick?

---

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.

**To:** +12025283329[+12025283329]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Wed 8/2/2017 10:00:01 PM  
**Subject:** 8/2 Calendar Summary

(1/4)8/2: 5 Events(next 24 hrs)  
8/3 11:00 AM-12:00 PM  
OCE ALL HANDS MEETING - Call In# 1-866-299-3188 Code: 202 564-3257#  
3216 ARS

(2/4)8/3 11:00 AM-12:00 PM  
PacifiCorp-Hunter Title V Petition Response  
Room 4045 WJC North

(3/4)8/3 12:00 PM-1:00 PM  
FW: Midwest Gen Plaintiffs' Meeting  
866-410-9426, Conference code: 761 012 7617, Security Code: 6515

(4/4)8/3 2:30 PM-3:00 PM  
Hosting Call- 6952  
(No Location)

==

8/3 2:30 PM-3:30 PM  
National Air Enforcement Call  
(866) 299-3188; 202 564 5666#

**To:** Keller, Peter[keller.peter@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Mon 7/10/2017 5:35:32 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter petition call

I am but I am running late on a negotiation call.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Keller, Peter  
**Sent:** Monday, July 10, 2017 1:35 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Hunter petition call

Hi Terri, were you going to join us? 919-541-5230

Peter Keller, PE

US EPA | OAQPS | AQPD | NSRG

(919) 541-2065





**To:** Dean, Abigail[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Fri 7/7/2017 6:04:19 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Quick Chat about Hunter Petition

No worries. Sorry-it has been a crazy day for me.

Terri Dykes  
Senior Attorney  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

---

**From:** Dean, Abigail  
**Sent:** Friday, July 07, 2017 2:03 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Dean, Abigail <Dean.Abigail@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Quick Chat about Hunter Petition

Hi Terri. I'm sorry. I have an appointment I need to leave for right at 1:30 MT. I will set something up for next week. Thanks and I apologize for the difficulty scheduling.

Abigail Dean, Attorney  
Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

-----Original Appointment-----

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Friday, July 07, 2017 11:26 AM  
**To:** Dean, Abigail  
**Subject:** Tentative: Quick Chat about Hunter Petition  
**When:** Friday, July 07, 2017 12:00 PM-12:15 PM (UTC-07:00) Mountain Time (US & Canada).  
**Where:** Abby to call Terri

Can you do 3:30? I have at 2:00.

**To:** Gmyr, Joanna[Gmyr.Joanna@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Fri 7/7/2017 5:46:07 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Petition Workgroup Meeting - DRAFT Response Options

IT is showing up on mine.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Gmyr, Joanna  
**Sent:** Friday, July 07, 2017 1:36 PM  
**To:** Keller, Peter <keller.peter@epa.gov>; Krallman, John <krallman.john@epa.gov>; Laumann, Sara <Laumann.Sara@epa.gov>; Wauters, Patrick <wauters.patrick@epa.gov>; Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Cherry, Randall <Cherry.Randall@epa.gov>; Dean, Abigail <Dean.Abigail@epa.gov>; Law, Donald <Law.Donald@epa.gov>; Fallon, Gail <fallon.gail@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Petition Workgroup Meeting - DRAFT Response Options

Please confirm that Monday's (July 10<sup>th</sup>) Hunter workgroup meeting @ 1:30 pm EST is showing up on your calendar.

If it is not, please block it off manually... Outlook doesn't work so well when a nonparticipant (me) is setting up the meetings.

My apologies for any confusion.

The call in number is still 919-541-5230

Thanks

**Joanna W. Gmyr**

**919-541-9782**

**Office of Air Quality Planning & Standards**

**Air Quality Policy Division**

**Operating Permits Group**

**Research Triangle Park, NC**

-----Original Appointment-----

**From:** Gmyr, Joanna

**Sent:** Friday, June 23, 2017 1:00 PM

**To:** Gmyr, Joanna; Keller, Peter; Krallman, John; Laumann, Sara; Wauters, Patrick; Dykes, Teresa; RTP-OAQPS-919-541-5230-OID-AQPD/Phone-Line/RTP-OAQPS-BLDG-C

**Cc:** Cherry, Randall; Dean, Abigail; Law, Donald; Fallon, Gail

**Subject:** Hunter Petition Workgroup Meeting - DRAFT Response Options

**When:** Monday, July 10, 2017 1:30 PM-2:30 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

**Where:** Call in: 919-541-5230

***Workgroup meeting to discuss draft response options***

**To:** Dean, Abigail[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Fri 7/7/2017 1:50:41 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Quick Chat about Hunter Petition

Abby- Can we move this to later today? Thanks.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

-----Original Appointment-----

**From:** Dean, Abigail

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 05, 2017 5:19 PM

**To:** Dean, Abigail; Dykes, Teresa

**Subject:** Quick Chat about Hunter Petition

**When:** Friday, July 07, 2017 9:00 AM-9:15 AM (UTC-07:00) Mountain Time (US & Canada).

**Where:** Abby to call Terri

Hi Terri. Happy to reschedule if this time doesn't work for you. Thanks for offering to help bring me up to speed.

Abigail Dean, Attorney

Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

**To:** Vetter, Cheryl[Vetter.Cheryl@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thur 7/20/2017 3:07:00 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter DD briefing??

Switching over now

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Vetter, Cheryl  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 20, 2017 11:06 AM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Hunter DD briefing??

Cheryl Vetter  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
OAQPS/AQPD/OPG (C504-03)  
Research Triangle Park, NC 27711  
Phone (919) 541-4391 Fax (919) 541-5509

Note: Positions or views expressed here do not represent official EPA policy.





**To:** Dean, Abigail[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tue 7/18/2017 9:37:25 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

Sure!

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Dean, Abigail  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 18, 2017 5:36 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Dean, Abigail <Dean.Abigail@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

I completely understand. Would you still be willing to share your thoughts/exchange ideas with us informally?

Abigail Dean, Attorney  
Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129

303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 18, 2017 3:27 PM  
**To:** Dean, Abigail <[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov](mailto:Dean.Abigail@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

With Apple being out until next week- I am not sure I can get that by the time you brief them.  
Sorry.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Dean, Abigail  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 18, 2017 5:24 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Dean, Abigail <[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov](mailto:Dean.Abigail@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

Hi Terri. I do apologize. I sent out a call-in number (Sara Laumann was calling in too) so when

you didn't call in or accept the invitation, I assumed you couldn't make it. We are briefing senior managers here in the region this week and they are very interested in the implications for enforcement. It would be extremely helpful to hear more about OECA's position on the matter. I will send out another meeting invitation.

Thank you,

Abby

Abigail Dean, Attorney  
Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 18, 2017 2:11 PM  
**To:** Dean, Abigail <[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov](mailto:Dean.Abigail@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

I was away from the office and figured you would call me (my work phone rings to my mobile), Sorry, I thought something came up for you.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Dean, Abigail  
**Sent:** Tuesday, July 18, 2017 12:13 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Dean, Abigail <[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov](mailto:Dean.Abigail@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

Hi Terri. Just checking in to see if you will be able to join a call today at 2PM ET regarding the PacificCorps Hunter Title V Petition. Jim Eppers and Sara Laumann are planning to attend. If not, I will cancel the meeting. Sara and I will be on the workgroup call Thursday morning.

Thanks!

Abby

Abigail Dean, Attorney  
Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Monday, July 03, 2017 2:52 PM  
**To:** Dean, Abigail <[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov](mailto:Dean.Abigail@epa.gov)>; Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter Title V Petition

Welcome aboard. I just printed off the materials to read on the way home. Happy to chat with you later this week or next if you want to just get grounded.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Dean, Abigail

**Sent:** Monday, July 03, 2017 4:50 PM

**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>; Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Dean, Abigail <[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov](mailto:Dean.Abigail@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** Hunter Title V Petition

Hi Apple and Terri. Jim Eppers asked me to represent the Region 8 Legal Enforcement Program in future meetings regarding the PacifiCorps Hunter Title V Petition. Peter Keller added me to the Hunter Sharepoint Site and I have started to review the relevant materials. I spoke with Sara Laumann last week and she suggested that I reach out to you to find out how I may be able to assist in this matter. If I can contribute to your efforts in any way, please let me know.

Thank you,

Abby Dean

Abigail Dean, Attorney  
Regulatory Enforcement Unit  
Legal Enforcement Program (8ENF-L)  
USEPA Region 8  
1595 Wynkoop Street  
Denver, CO 80202-1129  
303-312-6106  
FAX: 303-312-6953  
e:mail [dean.abigail@epa.gov](mailto:dean.abigail@epa.gov)

**To:** Dean, Abigail[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov]; Thompson, Christopher[Thompson.Christopher@epa.gov]; Laumann, Sara[Laumann.Sara@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Mon 8/7/2017 6:57:11 PM  
**Subject:** FW: Cases Cited in the Hunter Memo- 1 of 2  
[Hodanbosi 5-20-99 Supersession.pdf](#)  
[Ameren Decision 2016.pdf](#)  
[Ameren Decision Jan 2017.pdf](#)  
[United States v. Southern Indiana Gas Elec. Co. 2002 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 14040.pdf](#)  
[East KY Power COOP- Permit Shield.rtf](#)  
[US v. La. Generating LLC 938 F. Supp. 2d 615.pdf](#)

---

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Friday, August 04, 2017 11:47 AM  
**To:** Traylor, Patrick <traylor.patrick@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>; Brooks, Phillip <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Cases Cited in the Hunter Memo- 1 of 2

Six files attached.

Terri Dykes



Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

***CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.***

**To:** Dean, Abigail[Dean.Abigail@epa.gov]; Thompson, Christopher[Thompson.Christopher@epa.gov]; Laumann, Sara[Laumann.Sara@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Mon 8/7/2017 6:56:41 PM  
**Subject:** FW: Cases From the Hunter Memo 2 of 2  
Murphy Oil- 143 F Supp 2d 1054.rtf  
-Homer City Aug 2013.pdf  
Otter Tail 615 F 3d 1021.rtf  
US Response to MSJ on Title V Ameren.pdf  
Citizens Against Ruining the Env t v. EPA 535 F.3d 670.pdf

---

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Friday, August 04, 2017 11:48 AM  
**To:** Traylor, Patrick <traylor.patrick@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Chapman, Apple <Chapman.Apple@epa.gov>; Brooks, Phillip <Brooks.Phillip@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Cases From the Hunter Memo 2 of 2

Five files attached.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

***CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.***

**To:** Chapman, Apple[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov]  
**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Fri 7/28/2017 6:54:46 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter briefing paper

Thanks. I am in the office this afternoon if you need anything. I am out Monday am-  
[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy] I suspect I will be in the  
[Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy] office by 12:30.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

**CONFIDENTIAL:** This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 6:20 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: Hunter briefing paper

It's at 2:15 in the AA conference room. Yes, you should attend.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**From:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 5:54 PM  
**To:** Chapman, Apple <[Chapman.Apple@epa.gov](mailto:Chapman.Apple@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** Re: Hunter briefing paper

Thanks for doing that. What time is the meeting on Monday. And do you want me to attend. I am fine not attending.

Terri Dykes  
Air Enforcement Division  
Office of Civil Enforcement  
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20640  
(202) 564-9883

---

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Thursday, July 27, 2017 5:29 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa  
**Cc:** Krallman, John  
**Subject:** Hunter briefing paper

Teri

Susan asked me to add the other two options to our briefing paper. This is what she is sending up to Patrick for the meeting on Monday. I'm copying John so OGC has a copy of our paper.

**Ms. Apple Chapman** |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|

**To:** Dykes, Teresa[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov]  
**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Mon 8/28/2017 6:46:34 PM  
**Subject:** Re: we have some prep work on Hunter for Patrick

Yes

Sent from my iPhone

On Aug 28, 2017, at 2:43 PM, Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)> wrote:

Are you free now? **Ex. 6 - Personal Privacy** I can pop down before I go.

Terri Dykes

Senior Attorney

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW

Washington, DC 20460

202.564.9883

*CONFIDENTIAL: This transmission may contain deliberative and/or enforcement confidential, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you have received this message in error, you are asked to notify the sender and to delete this message.*

**From:** Chapman, Apple  
**Sent:** Monday, August 28, 2017 2:42 PM  
**To:** Dykes, Teresa <[Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov](mailto:Dykes.Teresa@epa.gov)>  
**Subject:** we have some prep work on Hunter for Patrick

Let's talk today if you are available.

*Ms. Apple Chapman* |Deputy Director, Air Enforcement Division | U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Washington DC, 20004 |202-564-5666 (office)|202-841-6076 (mobile)|